

Nineteenth-Century Music Review

<http://journals.cambridge.org/NCM>

Additional services for *Nineteenth-Century Music Review*:

Email alerts: [Click here](#)

Subscriptions: [Click here](#)

Commercial reprints: [Click here](#)

Terms of use : [Click here](#)



Jann Pasler, *Composing the Citizen: Music as Public Utility in Third Republic France* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2009). xxii+794 pp. \ \$60.00.

Rémy Campos

Nineteenth-Century Music Review / Volume 8 / Issue 02 / December 2011, pp 320 - 322
DOI: 10.1017/S1479409811000383, Published online: 24 November 2011

Link to this article: http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract_S1479409811000383

How to cite this article:

Rémy Campos (2011). *Nineteenth-Century Music Review*, 8, pp 320-322 doi:10.1017/S1479409811000383

Request Permissions : [Click here](#)

constantly use the one to find meaning or justification for the other.¹³ A song, following Nägeli, achieves a 'higher artistic whole', and perhaps some of its meaning remains ineffable. In the polyrhythm of text, voice, and piano each part can be appreciated in its own right; some elements of the text or music remain expressive within their respective domains without crossing over to another. This assumption is made explicit in Malin's epilogue, 'Song Analysis and Musical Pleasure', when he, citing poet and critic John Ciardi, distinguishes between the ultimate unknowableness of exactly 'what' a poem or song means and the understandability and pleasure in discovery of just 'how' it means it.¹⁴

Rufus Hallmark

Rutgers, The State University of New Jersey
hallmark@rci.rutgers.edu

doi:10.1017/S1479409811000371

Jann Pasler, *Composing the Citizen: Music as Public Utility in Third Republic France* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2009). xxii+794 pp. \$60.00.

Never have political questions disquieted the French as much as during the period that extends from 1789 to the establishment of the Third Republic in 1871, this nineteenth century that historians have sometimes called the century of revolutions. The history of France during this period is that of a continuously recommenced social reformation, which found its solution only in the years 1870–80, when it worked out a sort of national compromise around republican and bourgeois values.

The close ties between music and nationality in the last third of the nineteenth-century in Europe have been known for a long time. In her new book, Jann Pasler proposes to consider a heretofore less well-studied subject: the political (and civic) use of music by the Republican regime that was put in place in France after the military defeat in 1870.

This work breaks with the conventional methods of considering the music of that era. Forsaking both pure stylistic analysis and the traditional methods of social history, Pasler has assembled a considerable corpus of archival data, which she has reformulated around a transversal question: how is society 'made' by music? Rarely has work devoted to this period had so much supporting documentation, and been accorded, above all, so much careful interest in its organization. On behalf of this pressing matter of music history (a discipline usually preoccupied with scores), the author calls upon a range of cultural artefacts, including pamphlets articles from the press, a large quantity of images and collections of concert programmes.

Despite the wealth of information, however, it is nevertheless regrettable that she did not make more systematic use of the rich archives of the Ministry of Public Instruction (chief archives for reconstructing the involvement of the State in the dissemination of music in the nineteenth century). Generally speaking, the manuscript documents therein are absent from this book: for example, the

¹³ Kofi Agawu, 'Theory and Practice in the Analysis of the Nineteenth-Century Lied', *Music Analysis* 11 (1992): 3–36.

¹⁴ John Ciardi, *How Does a Poem Mean?* Vol. 3 of *An Introduction to Literature*, ed. Gordon N. Ray (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1959).

private correspondence might have magnificently completed the documentation utilised in the book.

In spite of that, one savours page after page of this almost encyclopaedic attempt to capture the music of an era. The reader encounters a number of figures who are often neglected by the historiography of music: figures like Julien Tiersot, Louis-Albert Bourgault-Ducoudray, Alfred Bruneau, Léo Delibes, Théodore Dubois, Benjamin Godard, Victorin Joncières, Émile Paladilhe, Ernest Reyer and even Ambroise Thomas. Pasler has also made use of the testimony of music critics and politicians whose artistic involvement was crucial.

The reader will also welcome the manner in which the author deconstructs the acknowledged pantheon of French music by refusing to limit it to over-restrictive categories. Thus, one comes across references to the great department stores like Le Bon Marché, the halls of the *café-concerts*, or the cabarets like Ba-Ta-Clan or the Chat Noir, sites of music-making that are, of course, less well recognized than the Opéra, the *Concerts Colonne*, *Pasdeloup* or *Lamoureux*, the Conservatoire or the Société Nationale, but which are essential when one strives to understand the musical practices of the France of Jules Grévy¹ without judging their *a priori* value.

Pasler's book is also characterised by a profusion of interpretive concepts. The one given in the title of the work – the concept of public utility – is discussed at length at the outset of the book. But others interwoven throughout this monumental study include the access to music, assimilation, the public good, the notion of competition, those of democratisation, of distinction, of listening and of egalitarianism. The author offers for each theme some very personal views which surely will be eagerly debated by the specialists, but which have the capacity to stimulate considerable reflection.

The extensive material and wealth of interpretation, which open a myriad of avenues of enquiry – the elaboration of a new history of music, colonial music, music in the department stores, racial theories and so forth – poses a permanent invitation to revise inherited histories. Thus, previously studied problems such as Wagnerism or musical nationalism will be seen in a new light.

The argument revolves around two questions: who produces the meaning of music? and how does one proceed to use music for political ends? The answer alternates between the analysis of exceptional events (e.g., the campaign in favour of General Boulanger or the Universal Expositions) and the tracing of historical movements (popular musical education, standardization of practices) that had long-term effects on French society. It should be added that Pasler's work dedicates many pages to the exploration of the real upheaval that followed the multiplication of contacts with extra-European musical worlds: how the French succeeded in sonorously constructing the Republic – that very particular universality – while more and more musicians came from the four corners of the world to disturb the established order.

Ever since the work of Jürgen Habermas popularised it, the notion of a *public space* has known great success among scholars in the humanities.² Until now, however, few scholars have attempted to explore it in the musical domain. Beyond the discussion of 'utility', which runs through the book and could

¹ Jules Grévy, 1807–1891, was the first president of the Third Republic, serving from 1871–3.

² Jürgen Habermas, *Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere: An Inquiry into a category of Bourgeois Society*, trans. Thomas Burger and Frederick Lawrence (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1989).

without difficulty be extended to most of the Western societies at the end of the nineteenth century, *Composing the Citizen* opens a more 'local' debate, by posing the question of a specifically French model at once according to the definition of a musical politics (in the sense of the actions taken by the State to convert an entire population to a republican regime) and according to the constitution of a political conception of music (as an instrument of civic harmony).

Rémy Campos

Conservatoire National Supérieur de Musique et de Danse de Paris
Haute École de Musique de Genève

doi:10.1017/S1479409811000383

Luca Sala, ed., *European Fin-de-Siècle and Polish Modernism: The Music of Mieczysław Karłowicz*. Ad Parnassum Studies 4 (Bologna: Ut Orpheus Edizioni, 2010). xv+415 pp.

In the introduction to this first-rate volume of collected essays, Luca Sala writes that he aimed to explore the broader European musical and cultural framework that ultimately inspired Mieczysław Karłowicz's (1876–1909) life and works. Sala shows a deep understanding of the composer's musical contributions in the book's opening chapter, 'Il senso dell'assoluto e l'idea dell'arte nell'opera di Mieczysław Karłowicz'. The author makes use of musical examples, as well as excerpts from the composer's memoirs and letters, to evaluate the way in which the composer employs unusual timbres to create a fresh orchestral texture that incorporates layers of luminous sound structures. Sala concludes that, although the composer was inspired by the images surrounding his life in the Tatra region, his music largely represents an organic outgrowth of the European *fin-de-siècle* compositional style.

The book is divided into two sections: 'European *Fin-de-Siècle* and Polish Modernism' and 'The Works of Mieczysław Karłowicz'. The first section revolves around social and political nuances that reveal the extent of Karłowicz's acceptance of a European cultural tradition that existed both within Poland and outside its borders; the second delves into the composer's compositional process and reception history. The book opens with three essays, concerning the composer's life in Poland. In 'La Polonia al tempo di Mieczysław Karłowicz', Andrej Cwiałba focuses on the historical and cultural background of Polish music from the eighteenth century to the close of the nineteenth, and examines Karłowicz's musical and historical links to the nation's past. Agata Mierzejewska's 'Jan Karłowicz: A Portrait with Mieczysław in the Background' illuminates the composer's life in Poland, pointing out that the Karłowicz family descended from Polish nobility; they had their own coat of arms and belonged to rich Polish/Lithuanian gentry (p. 55). Drawing on letters, memoirs, and contemporary accounts, Mierzejewska offers a fascinating account of Karłowicz's father, Jan Aleksander Ludwik August, who studied theory and history with the renowned François-Joseph Fétis at the Conservatoire Royal de Musique de Bruxelles. The elder Karłowicz was an advocate of a new notation system that involved the substitution of the staff system with equivalent symbols; the project did not develop beyond its initial stages. The author concludes that despite Jan Karłowicz's Western-European and secular education, his works nonetheless show distinct qualities associated with the Lithuanian music that he vividly