



Review

Author(s): Keith E. Clifton

Review by: Keith E. Clifton

Source: *Fontes Artis Musicae*, Vol. 59, No. 1 (January-March 2012), pp. 72-74

Published by: [International Association of Music Libraries, Archives, and Documentation Centres \(IAML\)](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/42765557>

Accessed: 14-09-2015 04:40 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



International Association of Music Libraries, Archives, and Documentation Centres (IAML) is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Fontes Artis Musicae*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

Hartmanns Interesse an der „Musikalität abstrakter Malerei“ (S. 217ff.). Die Ausführungen werden durch angehängte Abbildungen bereichert.

Im gewichtigen Schlusssatz des Bandes gibt Hanns-Werner Heister eine profunde Bestandsaufnahme zur „Semantik von Hartmanns Musik“, als deren Nestor Heister selbst gelten kann. Auf der Basis theoretischer Grundüberlegungen zeigt er Ergebnisse und verweist zahlreich auf weiterführende Untersuchungen. Weitere Ausführungen gelten der Einordnung in den Rahmen der Musik um ihn herum und in die politische Zeitgeschichte. Als Seitenblick verweist Heister auf zwei CD-Booklet-Texte, in denen die Berücksichtigung der Hartmann-Forschung einen „Höhe- bzw. Tiefpunkt erreicht“ (S. 261f.). Abschließend benennt er, schon unter Einbezug des Hartmann-Symposiums, dessen Bericht hier vorliegt, Desiderate der Forschung und geht dabei kritisch mit gegenwärtigen Tendenzen der Musikwissenschaft ins Gericht (S. 263). Ergänzend können als Desiderate die Erschließung der „Choral“ benannten Partie im Bratschenkonzert (Edelmann S. 36) und in der 4. Variation des Mittelsatzes der 1. Symphonie genannt werden. Der ebenso „Choral“ genannte 4. Satz des *Concerto funebre* zitiert eine Melodie, das Lied „Unsterbliche Opfer“, das zwar kein Choral ist wie der Hussitenchoral im 1. Satz, aber dennoch der „verdeckte[n] Schreibweise“ (Rathert S. 13, Heister S. 235) angehört. Es ist sehr wahrscheinlich, dass auch den beiden anderen Chorälen eine präexistente Melodie mit semantischem Gehalt zugrunde liegt und nicht nur ein gewisses Choralidiom mit dem Titel gemeint ist. Ein weiteres Desiderat wäre die semantische Dechiffrierung des „Les Adieux“-Zitates im ersten Satz der Klaviersonate, „27. April 1945“.

Trotz der ergebnisreichen Hartmann-Forschung, zu der vorliegende Band zweifellos wichtige und weiterführende Bausteine geliefert hat, muss beklommen festgestellt werden, dass Hartmanns Leben vor allem zwischen 1933 und 1945 immer noch in mancher Hinsicht im Dunkeln liegt und weiterer Forschungen bedarf. Wir wissen von seinen Kompositionen, von wenigen Reisen und Manches aus seinen Briefen, aber kann das

allein 12 Jahre füllen? Wie sah sein Alltag aus, mit wem war er regelmäßig in München in Kontakt, welche Konzerte besuchte, mit wem musizierte er und welche Noten kaufte er? Heister spricht einerseits davon, dass Werk und Leben Hartmanns im Prinzip gut erforscht seien, es andererseits aber noch außerordentlich viel zu erforschen gebe (S. 263 und S. 249). Im Bereich der Quellen wäre eine kritische Brief-Ausgabe einschließlich der in der Bayerischen Staatsbibliothek befindlichen Dokumente ein erster Schritt. Ebenso wäre die Publikation der noch unveröffentlichten Werke dringlich. Nützlich wäre des Weiteren, die Bestände von Hartmanns Bibliothek genau zu kennen, einschließlich der von ihm vorgenommenen Eintragungen. Für die Befragung von – weiteren – Zeitzeugen ist es fast zu spät.

Stefan Hanheide
Universität Osnabrück

Composing the Citizen: Music as Public Utility in Third Republic France. By Jann Pasler. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2009. [xxii, 789 p. ISBN 978-0-5202-5740-5. \$60.00]

When modern politicians refer to decisions made for the “common good,” access to essential services such as electricity, water, and police protection may immediately spring to mind. In France, however, the related concept of *utilité publique* (public utility) is more nuanced, centered on how government serves the public interest and influences policy decisions. With a legacy extending back to the seventeenth century and, in a broader sense, to the writings of Plato, the role of music in advancing *utilité publique* has often been overlooked. As Jann Pasler argues in her imposing new book, after the Franco-Prussian War music played a defining role in shaping or “composing” the populace into productive citizens. For a Republic still reeling from a crushing military defeat and comprised of diverse competing factions, music helped to unite the French under a common national identity. Pasler’s careful research and deft analysis of history, politics, society, and culture during the early Third Republic—despite its title, the book centers nearly exclusively on the 1870–1900 period, rather than the entire era

to 1940—is a model of broad, interdisciplinary research extending beyond the traditional boundaries of musicology.

Pasler's decision to start with a "Walking Tour" of Paris allows her to unveil salient concepts from the outset. With the gradual expansion of Paris to twenty *arrondissements* by 1860, accomplished in part through Georges Haussmann's "urban surgery" (p. 17) that transformed narrow streets into grand boulevards, politicians began linking architecture and urban design with public *moeurs* (customs). The role of music in reviving the legacy of the Revolution and supporting a common identity occupies much of Part One. Drawing on varied primary sources and featuring overlooked composers such as Gossec, Pasler highlights the role of patriotic songs, choruses, and wind music as the "collective voice" (p. 145) of the people.

In Part Two, Pasler explores the evolving role of music in primary school education and the growth of large group communal singing. Operas including Ambroise Thomas's domestic drama *Mignon* and Auguste Mermet's *Jeanne d'Arc* (one of several works on Joan of Arc performed during the Moral Order), were critical in demonstrating a unified view of the Republic. One of Pasler's most surprising revelations was the ubiquity of concerts held in venues not traditionally associated with music making, including Parisian department store Bon Marché. Requiring extensive rehearsals and using employees as performers, these occasions were popular with audiences across the social spectrum. For Pasler, group singing at Bon Marché events "could ease tensions and deepen bonds, strengthening community" (p. 199), although she does not fully justify how this was achieved.

Later, she surveys concerts (more than fifty in the 1870s and 80s alone) that took place at a Paris zoo. These allowed the general public—who often could not afford tickets to symphony, chamber, or opera concerts—access to professional musicians of the highest caliber. I wished for more detailed commentary on these unconventional events: were they unique to Paris or evident in other parts of France as well? The author deftly corrects several prevailing views regarding concert life during this period, as it be-

came increasingly common to intersperse older works with new French music. Facsimiles of concert programs allow readers to examine a variety of eclectic programs, where it was customary to hear "Dubois next to Lully, or Gounod, Bizet, and Saint-Saëns after Handel" (p. 218).

Pasler argues that after the 1878 World Exposition the French government became less influenced by the Catholic church and more secular in outlook. Using an 1882 Concerts Colonne event as an example, she demonstrates how secular and sacred works often shared the same programs, even on major religious holidays. The mingling of social classes and wide acceptance of music's didactic role led to concerts featuring works by Grétry and Méhul, the latter posited as "the Jacques-Louis David of dramatic music" (p. 340). Specific parallels between Méhul and the French painter are never made explicit, reflecting Pasler's tendency to devote minimal attention to the visual arts.

Since the subject of music in the former French colonies is intricate and often contentious, Pasler devotes a carefully nuanced chapter to the subject. Building on her previous research on popular song (*chansons populaires*),¹ she notes how imported examples of European music could provide "a context for colonists to distinguish themselves from the natives" (p. 401). References to exotic works include Saint-Saëns's little-known *Suite algérienne* along with Delibes's *Lakmé*, set in British-occupied India but rife with parallels to French colonial affairs. Pasler returns briefly to colonialism in a later chapter focused on the 1889 World Exposition, where "non-Western people were displayed in constructed villages" (p. 570) for the enjoyment of French spectators. But as we know from the example of Debussy, strongly influenced by authentic Javanese gamelan music, the Exposition could serve as more than mere entertainment.

1. For a fuller discussion of the *chanson populaire*, see Pasler's "Race and nation: musical acclimatisation and the *chansons populaires* in Third Republic France" in *Western Music and Race*, ed. Julie Brown, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007: 147–67.

Part Four—the largest section at just over two hundred pages—explores the renewed interest in early music around 1890 as well as growing concerns regarding Wagner's influence on the French arts as a whole. Pasler reads Saint-Saëns's Third Symphony as a response to Wagner and Debussy's *Cinq poèmes de Baudelaire* as the "intersection of Wagnerian and symbolist aesthetics" (p. 532). Shifting gears, she briefly outlines the significance of a Satiesque group called "Les Incohérents" who employed humorous elements in works such as Alphonse Allais's *Marche funèbre* (1884) that includes no written music. Two chapters and a "Coda" advance the discussion to the turn of the twentieth century, including France's steady support for new music after 1890; the integration of old and new compositional approaches in works such as Debussy's *Suite bergamasque*; the popularity of historical concerts (*concerts historiques*) in reviving interest in earlier composers; and the unabated political use of historical figures (Joan of Arc again). As audiences from all social classes and genders were able to study music and attend concerts, Pasler contends, what it meant to be authentically French continued to be redefined.

A brief review cannot do justice to the remarkable achievement that *Composing the Citizen* represents. As the first volume in a proposed trilogy, the book represents the culmination of years of painstaking archival work and a solid foundation for the author's subsequent research. Make no mistake: despite an obvious visual appeal supported by photographs, source documents, and musical examples, this tightly packed monograph tests the reader's stamina over the course of nearly 800 pages of dense prose and meticulous footnotes on virtually every page. The omission of a separate bibliography—less egregious given the book's girth—diminishes its value to a scholarly audience interested in ready access to Pasler's expansive source base.

A consistent focus on historical and cultural issues—mostly centered on Paris while the rest of the nation receives scant attention—means that detailed musical analyses are sparse, despite astute commentary on a variety of works. These concerns, however, in no way diminish the fundamental importance of Pasler's work.

Written in a lively, engaging style, the book will amply reward those with the tenacity to plumb its substantial depths, becoming an indispensable source on its subject for years to come. I look forward to the next installment.

Keith E. Clifton
Central Michigan University

Estonian Sound Recordings 1939. Edited by Kadri Steinbach and Urve Lippus. Tallinn. Estonian Academy of Music and Theatre. 2009. [304 p., with 12 CDs. ISBN 978-99859797-7-8. €106]

Over a few weeks from May to June 1939, the Estonian State Broadcasting Company embarked on an ambitious project – to record '100 Estonian Compositions on 10,000 Records' (p. 13) in the words of one newspaper. The records were to have been produced in England, but the outbreak of war and the subsequent disappearance of the broadcasting company, and indeed the Republic of Estonia itself, meant that the records were never made (with the exception of a small number issued in Denmark in the 1950s). Now this collection has been made available in the form of a beautifully produced book (texts are in English and Estonian) with twelve ingeniously attached CDs (if Apple designed real books, they would look like this). Some of the matrices had been held in Danish archives, and about a third of the total was found in the EMI archives in England. The Danish matrices were given to Estonia as a 90th birthday present, and many Estonian institutions supported their restoration and publication. Along with the editors, the engineers Claus Byrith and Johann Daendler (the original 1939 sound engineer, who died in 2006 at the age of 95) can share the honours for a truly remarkable achievement.

The 1930s saw a vigorous promotion of national Estonian culture, by an authoritarian government which had been in charge since 1934. The year 1938 had marked the twentieth anniversary of the Republic of Estonia. Estonian musicians appeared frequently on European radio stations, and Estonian embassies promoted their music abroad. This group of recordings was possibly intended for the use of Estonian embassies abroad in order that they could pro-